

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 STATE 197129
ORIGIN NODS-00

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /001 R

66011
DRAFTED BY:S/S:PTARNOFF:JLH
APPROVED BY:S/S:PTARNOFF
-----090480 182301Z /61
O 182211Z AUG 77 ZFF4
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO WHITE HOUSE IMMEDIATE

S E C R E T STATE 197129

NODIS
WHITE HOUSE FOR BRZEZINSKI

FOL REPEAT TEL AVIV 6116 ACTION SECSTATE DTD 17 AUG.

QUOTE

S E C R E T TEL AVIV 6116

NODIS

FOR ATHERTON FROM LEWIS

FOLLOWING SENT ACTION USDEL SECRETARY AIRCRAFT AUGUST 11
REPEATED FOR YOUR ACTION

HEREWITH FOLLOWS PORTION OF TEL AVIV 5958 DEALING WITH BEGIN/
DAYAN CONVERSATION WITH SECRETARY AS REQUESTED IN MCKUNE-GLASPIE
PHONE CONVERSATION AUG 17.

QUOTE
S E C R E T TEL AVIV 5958

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 STATE 197129

NODIS

FOR THE SECRETARY FROM LEWIS

E.O. 11652: GDS
TAGS: OVIP (VANCE, CYRUS)
SUBJECT: DRAFT MESSAGE ON YOUR PRIVATE MEETING WITH

BEGIN AND DAYAN, AUGUST 10

1. FOLLOWING IS A DRAFT MESSAGE FROM YOU TO THE ACTING SECRETARY AND THE WHITE HOUSE ON THE RESTRICTED BEGIN/ DAYAN MEETING YESTERDAY WHICH YOU ASKED ME TO PREPARE. YOU SAID YOU WOULD ALSO ADD TO IT ADDITIONAL MATERIAL FROM YOUR PRIVATE TETE-A-TETE WITH BEGIN LAST NIGHT AND FROM YOUR DINNER DISCUSSION WITH DAYAN.

2. BEGIN DRAFT TEXT:

3. IN VIEW OF THE LARGE GROUP PARTICIPATING IN THE MEETINGS WITH THE ISRAELIS, PRIME MINISTER BEGIN AND I AGREED TO MEET WITH ONLY FOREIGN MINISTER DAYAN AND AMBASSADOR LEWIS TO GO FURTHER INTO QUESTIONS OF SOUTH LEBANON AND FUTURE ISRAELI SETTLEMENTS POLICY. THIS MEETING TOOK PLACE IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE FINAL GENERAL SESSION IN LATE MORNING AUGUST 10.

4. SETTLEMENTS IN THE OCCUPIED TERRITORIES:
BEGIN BEGAN BY REVIEWING THE "MISUNDERSTANDING" BETWEEN US OVER THE LEGALIZATION OF THREE EXISTING SETTLEMENTS, STRESSING WITH ALL APPARENT SINCERITY THAT HE HONESTLY HAD NO IDEA THIS KIND OF "ROUTINE ACTION" WOULD HAVE BEEN VIEWED SO ADVERSELY BY THE U.S. HE REFERRED TO HIS EARLIER PROPOSAL THAT "WE
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 03 STATE 197129

HAVE AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN US ON ANY SUCH CASES TO EXPLORE THEM INITIALLY THROUGH DIPLOMATIC CHANNELS, EITHER AMBASSADOR LEWIS OR AMBASSADOR DINITZ, IN ORDER TO AVOID SUCH MISUNDERSTANDINGS." I CAREFULLY RECOUNTED THE CIRCUMSTANCES IN WASHINGTON SURROUNDING THIS INCIDENT AND MADE CLEAR THAT WE HAD INDEED WAITED UNTIL AMBASSADOR DINITZ HAD CONFIRMED FOR US THE FACTS BEFORE MAKING ANY PUBLIC STATEMENT. I WENT ON TO UNDERSCORE OUR BELIEF THAT THE WHOLE QUESTION OF SETTLEMENTS IS A TERRIBLY SENSITIVE PROBLEM, ESPECIALLY AT THIS POINT IN OUR EFFORTS TO MOVE TOWARD GENEVA. I SAID THAT WE SINCERELY HOPED HE WOULD NOT APPROVE ANY NEW SETTLEMENTS FOR THIS REASON.

5. BEGIN THEN ASKED DAYAN TO TELL ME WHAT THE ISRAELI GOVERNMENT POLICY TOWARD NEW SETTLEMENTS WOULD BE. DAYAN SAID "WE CANNOT STOP SETTLEMENTS ALTOGETHER, OR EVEN SUSPEND NEW SETTLEMENTS FOR ANY SUBSTANTIAL PERIOD OF TIME. SUCH AN EFFORT WOULD NOT BE SUSTAINABLE, JUST AS THE BRITISH EFFORT TO LIMIT OR SUSPEND IMMIGRATION INTO ISRAEL DURING THE MANDATE PERIOD NEVER PROVED ENFORCEABLE OR SUSTAINABLE.

HOWEVER, RECOGNIZING THE SENSITIVITY OF THE PROBLEM, WHAT WE HAVE IN MIND IS TO LIMIT NEW SETTLEMENT ACTIVITY DURING "THE NEXT FEW MONTHS" TO ABOUT SIX TO EIGHT LOCATIONS, ALL ON LAND ENCOMPASSED IN EXISTING MILITARY BASE AREAS, ON GOVERNMENT-OWNED LAND CURRENTLY UNDER MILITARY CONTROL. APPROXIMATELY 40-50 CIVILIAN FAMILIES WOULD BE PERMITTED TO SETTLE IN SUCH AREAS; NO ACQUISITION OF NEW LAND WOULD BE INVOLVED, AND CERTAINLY NO ARABS WOULD BE IN ANY WAY DISPLACED. ALL THESE NEW SETTLEMENTS WOULD BE WITHIN 25 KILOMETERS OF THE 'GREEN LINES.' TWO WOULD BE IN THE AREA NEAR JERUSALEM." (THIS IS OBVIOUSLY EXACTLY THE SAME FORMULA WHICH DAYAN HAD EARLIER OUTLINED ON JULY 24 11 SEE TEL AVIV 5442.)

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 04 STATE 197129

IN RESPONSE TO A LATER QUERY BY LEWIS, DAYAN ACKNOWLEDGED THAT EVEN UNDER HIS CRITERIA SOME OF THE SETTLEMENTS WOULD BE CLOSE TO THE CENTER OF THE WEST BANK, BUT HE INSISTED THAT NONE WOULD BE CLOSE TO HEAVILY POPULATED AREAS.

6. I RESPONDED THAT WE OBVIOUSLY HAD A CONTINUING DIFFERENT INTERPRETATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL SITUATION, AS HAD BEEN CLEARLY SPELLED OUT IN THE LARGER MEETING JUST PRECEDING THIS ONE. I SAID THAT IT IS THE MOVING OF CIVILIANS INTO MILITARY CAMPS WHICH RAISES THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PROBLEM IN OUR VIEW, SINCE UNDER THE GENEVA CONVENTION THE STATIONING OF MILITARY FORCES IN AN OCCUPIED TERRITORY IS PERMISSIBLE. I PRESSED THE QUESTION: "WHY IS IT NECESSARY?" IN RESPONSE, BEGIN ESSENTIALLY RESTATED THE HISTORIC ARGUMENTS WHICH HE MADE IN WASHINGTON TO THE PRESIDENT WHEN THIS SUBJECT WAS RAISED, REFERRED TO THE DEDICATION AND DETERMINATION OF THE "WONDERFUL YOUNG GENERATION" OF ISRAELI YOUTH, ESPECIALLY RELIGIOUS YOUTH, WHO ARE DETERMINED TO TILL THEIR HISTORIC LANDS; AND ALSO REFERRED TO THE PRESIDENT'S PRESS CONFERENCE STATEMENT THAT IT WOULD BE EASIER FOR THE U.S. IF EXISTING SETTLEMENTS WERE EXPANDED RATHER THAN NEW ONES BEING ESTABLISHED. BEGIN WENT ON TO SAY THAT QUITE FRANKLY HE COULD HAVE FOLLOWED THE PRACTICE OF PREVIOUS GOVERNMENTS BY WINKING AT THE ILLEGAL SQUATTING BY THE SETTLERS, SINCE HIS GOVERNMENT COULD NOT AND WOULD NOT EVER FORCIBLY REMOVE ILLEGAL SETTLERS. IF THEY WERE TO DO SO HIS GOVERNMENT WOULD NOT SURVIVE. BUT HE SAID HE DID NOT WANT TO FOLLOW SUCH DEVIOUS TACTICS; THAT HE WANTED TO BE PERFECTLY STRAIGHT FORWARD AND HONEST ON ALL MATTERS WITH US.

SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 05 STATE 197129

THEREFORE HE HOPED THAT THE PRESIDENT WOULD UNDERSTAND THE MOTIVES AND NECESSITY FOR HIS ACTIONS. HE FELT CONFIDENT THAT HE WOULD UNDERSTAND, SINCE PRESIDENT CARTER HAD ALREADY ACKNOWLEDGED PUBLICLY BEGIN'S ELECTORAL COMMITMENT ON THIS SETTLEMENT ISSUE. THERE WERE ONLY A FEW FAMILIES WHO WOULD BE INVOLVED. "WHAT WE ASK FOR IS NOT YOUR BLESSING BUT YOUR UNDERSTANDING. NOW YOU KNOW WHAT WE INTEND TO DO. PLEASE TALK TO PRESIDENT CARTER AND EXPLAIN OUR POSITION."

7. I ASSURED HIM I WOULD TALK TO THE PRESIDENT AS SOON AS I RETURN. BUT I SAID THAT THE PRESIDENT ALREADY UNDERSTANDS THIS PROBLEM BUT IS DEEPLY CONVINCED THAT ANY NEW SETTLEMENTS WILL GREATLY COMPLICATE THE PEACE-MAKING PROCESS.

8. DAYAN THEN INTERJECTED THAT HE KNEW HE WAS SPEAKING FOR THE PRIME MINISTER IN AGAIN SAYING THAT NO ISRAELI SETTLEMENT WILL BE AN OBSTACLE TO ANY PEACE AGREEMENT. IF AN AGREEMENT IS NEGOTIATED WHICH ESTABLISHES WITHDRAWAL TO A CERTAIN LINE WHICH LEAVES OUTSIDE THAT LINE A SETTLEMENT, THE ISRAELI GOVERNMENT WILL MOVE SUCH A SETTLEMENT. HE REPEATED THIS FLAT ASSURANCE. HE THEN WENT ON TO SAY, HOWEVER, THAT HE, DAYAN, WOULD NOT HAVE JOINED ANY GOVERNMENT WHICH PROHIBITED SETTLEMENT IN THE HISTORICAL AREAS OF JUDEA AND SAMARIA. (BEGIN INTERJECTED TO SAY "AND I WOULD NOT HAVE FORMED SUCH A GOVERNMENT.") DAYAN THEN SAID THAT THERE HAD NEVER BEEN AN ISRAELI GOVERNMENT WHICH DID NOT AUTHORIZE NEW SETTLEMENTS, THAT THE ONGOING SETTLEMENT PROCESS OF THE LAND IS AND WILL REMAIN A FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE FOR THE JEWISH STATE.

9. DAYAN CONCLUDED THIS DISCUSSION BY ARGUING THAT IN HIS VIEW THE ARAB REACTION TO THE SORT OF CARE-FULLY LIMITED SETTLEMENT PLAN THEY HAVE IN MIND WILL
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 06 STATE 197129

NOT BE ANYTHING LIKE THAT WHICH WE HAVE PREDICTED. HE INSISTED THAT THE MAJOR ISSUE FOR THE ARABS IS THE TAKING OF NEW LANDS FROM ARAB HANDS, AND THAT NO SUCH THING WOULD BE OCCURRING. WE LEFT THE ISSUE AT THIS POINT WITH MY PROMISING TO TAKE IT UP AGAIN WITH THE PRESIDENT, BUT LEAVING NO DOUBT THAT WE WOULD CONTINUE TO BE EXTREMELY CONCERNED SHOULD NEW SETTLE-

MENTS OCCUR.

UNQUOTE

END THIS PORTION OF TEXT

NOTE FROM EMBASSY TEL AVIV:

REMAINING SEVEN PARAGRAPHS OF MESSAGE PERTAIN TO

CONVERSATION ON SOUTH LEBANON AND ETHIOPIA.

IN THE INTEREST OF EXPEDIENCY, WE HAVE CHOSEN NOT TO REPEAT

THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MESSAGE.

LEWIS UNQTE VANCE

SECRET

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: Z
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: TEXT, POLICIES, LAND SETTLEMENT, CAT-A, DIPLOMATIC COMMUNICATIONS, MILITARY OCCUPIED AREAS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 18-Aug-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 22 May 2009
Decaption Note: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977STATE197129
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: S/S:PTARNOFF:JLH
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: N770005-0088
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions:
Image Path:
ISecure: 2
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770847/aaaabnhe.tel
Line Count: 234
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 06f38a58-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN NODS
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: NODIS
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: NODIS
Reference: n/a
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 22-Mar-2005 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 1556661
Secure: LOCK1
Status: NATIVE
Subject: DRAFT MESSAGE ON YOUR PRIVATE MEETING WITH BEGIN AND DAYAN, AUGUST 10
TAGS: OVIP, PSDC, PBOR, US, IS, LE, (VANCE, CYRUS)
To: WHITE HOUSE
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/06f38a58-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009